

From: JCLIM CEA <jclim@me.com>  
Subject: JCLIM Initial Decision for JCLI-3656  
To: "Ryan O'Donnell" <ode3197@yahoo.com>  
Cc: jcli3656@amsmts.org  
Date: Monday, April 12, 2010, 6:48 PM

Dear Dr. O'Donnell,

I am now in receipt of all reviews of the manuscript entitled "An Analysis of the Steig et al. (2009) Antarctic Temperature Reconstruction" (JCLI-3656) by Ryan O'Donnell, Nicholas Lewis, Steve McIntyre, Jeff Condon.

On the basis of these reviews and my own evaluation, it appears that the manuscript may be acceptable for publication in the Journal of Climate subject to some major and mandatory revision. Acceptance is contingent upon you (and your co-authors) satisfactorily addressing the concerns and suggestions of the reviewers. Copies of the reviews are enclosed for your information.

Please upload your revised manuscript along with a detailed explanation of how you have responded to the comments of each reviewer within three months of today's date. (By about July 16, 2010.)

When preparing your revisions, please refer to the enclosed Revision Checklist. Because the AMS is requesting that all revision submissions meet final production requirements, following this checklist closely will streamline the processing of your manuscript, should it be accepted at a future date. If you have any questions, please don't hesitate to contact me. Thank you.

Sincerely,

Anthony J. Broccoli

Chief Editor for the Journal of Climate

Attach: 3 initial reviews, Revision Checklist

\*\*\*\*\*

Reviews :

\*\*\*\*\*

\*\*\*\*\*

Revision Checklist :

\*\*\*\*\*