

From: JCLIM CEA <jclim@me.com>
To: Ryan O'Donnell
Cc: jcli3656@amsmts.org
Sent: Wed, November 24, 2010 5:10:39 PM
Subject: JCLIM Intermediate Decision for JCLI-3656

Dear Dr. O'Donnell,

Regarding your response to the final round of review "Improved methods for PCA-based reconstructions: case study using the Steig et al. (2009) Antarctic temperature reconstruction" (JCLI- 3656) by Ryan O'Donnell, Nicholas Lewis, Steve McIntyre, Jeff Condon.

I am satisfied with your response to the latest review from Rev. A. The only minor issue that should be addressed is an inconsistency between the abstract and the main text. The abstract states that "We also find differences in the seasonal patterns of temperature change, with winter and fall showing the largest differences and summer showing negligible difference outside of the Peninsula." However the main text (p. 25) mentions both spring and summer as having "minor to negligible differences." Please make the abstract consistent with the main text.

Please upload your revised manuscript within one month. (Before December 22, 2010.)

Sincerely,

Anthony J. Broccoli
Chief Editor for the Journal of Climate